From:	So Kim
Sent time:	08/13/2018 11:27:57 AM
To:	Andrea Vona <avona@pvplc.org>; Adrienne Mohan <amohan@pvplc.org>
Cc:	Ara Mihranian
Subject:	FW: Survey Report Tidal Influence
Attachments:	CAGNCAWR Survey Report 2018_Tidal Influence 8-10-18.pdf

Hi Andrea/Adrienne,
Attached is Trump's submitted annual gnatcatcher and coastal cactus wren survey.

Sincerely,
So Kim, AICP
Deputy Director/Planning Manager
Community Development Department
City of Rancho Palos Verdes
www.rpvca.gov
(310) 544-5222

From: Lili Amini [mailto:lamini@trumpnational.com]
Sent: Monday, August 13, 2018 8:56 AM
To: So Kim <SoK@rpvca.gov>
Subject: Fwd: Survey Report Tidal Influence

Hi So
Please see attached. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Get Outlook for iOS

From: Christine Marshall <cmarshall@trumpnational.com>
Sent: Monday, August 13, 2018 8:52 AM
To: Lili Amini
Subject: Survey Report Tidal Influence

Christine Marshall
Executive Administrative Assistant
Trump National Golf Club, Los Angeles
One Trump National Drive | Rancho Palos Verdes, CA | 90275
Phone- 310-303-3257
www.trumpgolf.com | www.trumpnationallosangeles.com

CAGNCAWR Survey Report 2018_Tidal Influence 8-10-18.pdf

1340 E. Florida St.
Long Beach, Ca 90802
Info@Tidalinfluence.com

Memorandum

To: Lili Amini, Trump National Golf Club **From:** Eric Zahn, Tidal Influence, LLC

Cc:

Date: August 10, 2018
Subject: Annual California Gnatcatcher and Coastal Cactus Wren Surveys

The purpose of this communication is to provide Trump National Golf Club (TNGC) with a report on annual surveys for the coastal California gnatcatcher (*Polioptila californica*) and the coastal cactus wren (*Campylorhynchus brunneicapillus*) within the Ocean Trails Reserve and Shoreline Park in Ranchos Palos Verdes, California.

Regulatory Setting:
The Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) for the golf course property has a long-term management program that requires, among other things, annual coastal California gnatcatcher and coastal cactus wren monitoring.

Section 4.11.1 of the HCP states the "Coastal California Gnatcatcher and Cactus Wren Monitoring will be conducted on an annual basis during the breeding season of these species. Annual surveys will begin upon the completion of the 5-year maintenance and monitoring program and shall continue until it is determined to be no longer necessary by the Restoration Ecologist and Biologist(s) and the Agencies. The surveys will focus on determining the extent and location of habitats used by coastal California Gnatcatchers and cactus wren on the site. All areas of appropriate habitat will be surveyed."

Survey Methods and Results:
Surveys for California gnatcatcher and coastal cactus wren were performed simultaneously by Tidal Influence ecologists on Friday July 13th, 2018 (6:00am-12:00pm) and Friday August 3rd, 2018 (6:00am-10:30am). The second survey was used to confirm the observation of the initial survey. All accessible habitat areas, comprising approximately 100 acres, within the Ocean Trails Preserve and Shoreline Park were surveyed (Figure 1).

Coastal California Gnatcatcher Surveys
All suitable and accessible coastal sage scrub habitat areas within the survey area were surveyed for the presence of coastal California gnatcatcher (CAGN). US Fish and Wildlife Services *Survey Protocol for the Coastal California Gnatcatcher* were followed. Surveys were conducted by slowly walking along existing trails adjacent to and within coastal sage scrub habitat. Surveyors scanned habitat areas with binoculars for the presence of CAGN individuals and when they were not observed CAGN vocalizations were broadcast to locate individuals. Vocalization broadcasting ceased once birds were located. Surveyors recorded whether an individual bird was male or female, a potential breeding pair, a potential family group, or a juvenile. The location of each bird was recorded using a Trimble Geo 7 handheld GPS unit outfitted with a Laser Rangefinder. The rangefinder allowed for the surveyors to record an exact location of the bird without trampling any vegetation. Approximate locations were also recorded by hand on an aerial map.

CAGNCAWR Survey Report 2018_Tidal Influence 8-10-18.pdf

A total of 16 potential CAGN breeding territories were observed (Figure 2). Due to the late timing of the surveys relative to peak breeding season, we are cautious to positively determine the locations of breeding territories. However, the surveys can help to demonstrate the extent and location of habitats used by CAGN. CAGN observations were relatively evenly dispersed throughout the habitat areas of the Ocean Trails Preserve and those birds remained somewhat consistent between the two survey bouts. The CAGN were not nearly as dense in Shoreline Park which is heavily invested with black mustard (*Brassica nigra*). This invasive plant species fragments and outcompetes coastal sage scrub, thus reducing the quality of habitat for CAGN.

Coastal Cactus Wren Surveys

All accessible cactus patches of coastal pricklypear (*Opuntia littoralis*) and coastal cholla (*Cylindropuntia prolifera*) within the survey area were surveyed for the presence of coastal cactus wren (CAWR). Surveys were conducted by scanning cactus patches with binoculars looking for nests and perching or foraging individuals. CAWR vocalizations were broadcast to locate individuals when they were not observed, as well as in inaccessible locations like steep bluffs or dense cactus patches. Vocalization broadcasting ceased once birds were located. Surveyors recorded whether the observation was of a nest, an individual, or a pair.

A total of 5 potential CAWN breeding territories were observed (Figure 3). Due to the late timing of the surveys relative to peak breeding season, we are cautious to positively determine the locations of breeding territories. However, the surveys can help to demonstrate the extent and location of habitats used by CAGN. Since this particular species has been reportedly declining in the Palos Verdes Peninsula area, the following is a description of each observation:

Location #1 – This patch of cactus is near the bottom of the Sunrise Trail. An individual was observed during both survey bouts and each time it was foraging on the ground.

Location #2 – This patch of cactus is located on the ocean-side of the Catalina Trail. A nest was observed here during the second survey bout (Figure 4). The nest looked fresh and was filled with fresh feathers. No fledglings were observed.

Location #3 – This patch of cactus is located on the Catalina Trail just past its junction with the Gnatcatcher Trail several meters down the steep decline towards Shoreline Park. An individual was observed perching on cactus during the first survey bout and a pair was observed perching on cactus during the second survey bout.

Location #4 – This patch of cactus straddles the Gnatcatcher Trail just as it enters Shoreline Park. An individual was observed perching on cactus during the first survey bout.

Location # 5 – This patch of cactus is located above the Gnatcatcher Trail just before it forks. An individual was observed perching on cactus during the first survey bout.

Recommendations:

- Surveys should be performed earlier in the year to effectively determine breeding territories. Many of the behaviors observed demonstrated that the birds were no longer at the peak of their nesting activity. Ideally, three surveys would be conducted, with the initial survey performed in April, another in May, and the last in June.
- Efforts to control black mustard in Shoreline Park should be considered in order to enhance habitat for CAGN.
- It should also be noted that several large patches of cactus occur along the bluff faces of the Ocean Trails Reserve that are inaccessible for this form of walk-through survey. There is likelihood CAWR are using these areas, and focused surveys from the beach with spotting scopes should be considered by the Palos Verdes Peninsula Land Conservancy.

Figure 1. Survey Area.

Figure 2. Coastal California Gnatcatcher locations.

Figure 3. Coastal Cactus Wren locations.

CAGNCAWR Survey Report 2018_Tidal Influence 8-10-18.pdf

Figure 4. Cactus Wren nest observed on August 3rd, 2018.